

RECEIVED
September 19, 2024
*Commission on
State Mandates*

Commission on State Mandates

September 27, 2024

Agenda VA(2): Appeal of Executive Director's Decision of Duplicate Test Claim and Motion to Consolidate

City of San Jose, Appellant

Municipal Regional Stormwater Permits

- This Commission is familiar with Stormwater Permits:
 - *Department of Finance v. Commission on State Mandates (County of San Diego)* (2022) 85 Cal.App.5th 535
 - *Department of Finance v. Commission on State Mandates (County of Los Angeles)* (2021) 59 Cal.App.5th 546
 - *Department of Finance v. Commission on State Mandates (County of Los Angeles)* (2017) 18 Cal.App.5th 661
 - *Department of Finance v. Commission on State Mandates (County of Los Angeles)* (2016) 1 Cal.5th 749

Pending Consolidated Action for San Francisco Region Permit (eff. 12/1/09)

California Regional Water Quality Control Board, San Francisco Region, Order No. R2-2009-0074, 10-TC-02, 10-TC-03, and 10-TC-05

- Consolidated Claims of the City of Dublin, City of San Jose, County of Santa Clara
- Draft Proposed Decision

Timeline on San José's New Test Claim

Date	Event
6/30/2023	Union City and San José file Test Claims
	San José Test of 10 Provisions: C.2, C.3, C.5., C.10, C.11, C.12, C.15, C.17, C.20, C.21
10/11/2023	Director's Decision Notice of Duplicate and Incomplete Test Claim
1/9/2024	Union City and San José file Amended Test Claims
	San José's Test limited to Provision C. 17 <i>Discharges Associated with Unsheltered Homeless</i>
2/23/2024	Notice of Duplicative and Incomplete Test Claims
5/2024	Union City and San José file Second Amended Test Claims
6/18/2024	Director's Rejection of Duplicative Claim
	Appeal of Decision

Regulation 2 CCR 1183.1

...the first claim filed on a statute or executive order by a similarly situated claimant is the test claim and ***no duplicate test*** claims will be accepted by the Commission. Other similarly situated affected agencies may participate in the process by filing comments in writing on any agenda item as provided in section 1181.10 of these regulations, and may attend any Commission hearing on the test claim and provide written or oral comments to the Commission.

Affected agencies that are not similarly situated, meaning that test claim statutes affect them differently, may file a test claim on the same statutes as the first claim, but must demonstrate how and why they are affected differently.

Provision C.17

Discharges Associated with Unsheltered Homeless Populations (new as of 7/1/22)

Municipal Regional Stormwater Permit
Order No. R2-2022-0018

NPDES Permit No. CAS612008
Provision C.17.

C.17. Discharges Associated with Unsheltered Homeless Populations

The purpose of this Provision is to identify and ensure the implementation of appropriate control measures, by all Permittees, to address non-stormwater discharges into MS4s associated with unsheltered homeless populations.

Municipal Regional Stormwater Permit
Order No. R2-2022-0018

NPDES Permit No. CAS612008
Provision C.17.

This task's broader goals are to recognize non-stormwater pollutant sources associated with unsheltered homeless populations, reasons for discharges, and means by which they occur, and develop useful information that can be used toward prioritizing individual Permittee and collaborative best management practices for reducing or

Municipal Regional Stormwater Permit
Order No. R2-2022-0018

NPDES Permit No. CAS612008
Provision C.17.

may be implemented include, but are not limited to, access to emergency shelters; the provision of social services and sanitation services; voucher programs for proper disposal of RV sanitary sewage; establishment of designated RV "safe parking" areas or formalized encampments with

C.17. Discharges Associated with Unsheltered Homeless Populations

The purpose of this Provision is to identify and ensure the implementation of appropriate control measures, by all Permittees, to address non-stormwater discharges into MS4s associated with unsheltered homeless populations, including discharges from areas where unsheltered people congregate (e.g., formal and informal encampments including, but not limited to, informal tent or small cabin encampments, areas where people living in vehicles park, and safe parking areas). This Provision refers to such discharges collectively as discharges associated with homelessness.

C.17 a Permittee Requirements

C.17 - 1

C.17 - 2

C.17 - 3

- (3) Each Permittee shall identify and implement appropriate best management practices to address MS4 discharges associated with homelessness that impact water quality, including those impacts that can lead to public health impacts. In addition, Permittees shall also evaluate and assess the effectiveness of those practices, specifically by reporting on the BMP control measures being implemented, the approximate portion of the Permittee's unsheltered homeless population and locations being served by those control measures, and the portion and locations of the Permittee's unsheltered homeless population not reached, or not fully reached by the implemented control measures. Examples of actions that

7/1/22)

C.17 - 2

Permit
NPDES Permit No. CAS612008
Provision C.17

ted include, but are not limited to, access to emergency shelter; the provision of social services and sanitation services; voucher programs for proper disposal of RV sanitary sewage; establishment of designated RV "safe parking" areas or formalized encampments with appropriate services; provision of mobile pump-out services; establishing and updating sidewalk/street/plaza cleaning standards for the cleanup and appropriate disposal of human waste; and establishing trash and waste cleanup or pickup programs within the Permittee's jurisdiction, or at the countywide or regional level.

se the information generated through the biennial point-counts and related information, and the regional (as described above) to review and update their actions.

ual Report, Permittees shall collectively submit, to the Regional Executive Officer, a best management practice report as required in Provision C.17.a.i.(2).

2025 Annual Reports, Permittees shall submit a map as required in Provision C.17.a.i.(1).

2025 Annual Reports, each Permittee shall report on the current practices being implemented and include the information reporting required in Provision C.17.a.i.(3) and any changes to existing actions that the Permittee will implement over existing practices.

Municipal Regional Stormwater Permit
Permit No. R2-2022-0018

NPDES Permit No. CAS612008
Provision C.17.

may be implemented include, but are not limited to, access to emergency shelters; the provision of social services and sanitation services; voucher programs for proper disposal of RV sanitary sewage; establishment of designated RV "safe parking" areas or formalized encampments with appropriate services; provision of mobile pump-out services; establishing and updating sidewalk/street/plaza cleaning standards for the cleanup and appropriate disposal of human waste; and establishing trash and waste cleanup or pickup programs within the Permittee's jurisdiction, or at the countywide or regional level.

C.17 - 3

- (3) Each Permittee shall identify and implement appropriate best management practices to address MS4 discharges associated with homelessness that impact water quality, including those impacts that can lead to public health impacts. In addition, Permittees shall also evaluate and assess the effectiveness of those practices, specifically by reporting on the BMP control measures being implemented, the approximate portion of the Permittee's unsheltered homeless population and locations being served by those control measures, and the portion and locations of the Permittee's unsheltered homeless population not reached, or not fully reached by the implemented control measures. Examples of actions that

7/1/22)

C.17 - 2

Permit
NPDES Permit No. CAS612008
Provision C.17

ted include, but are not limited to, access to emergency shelter; the provision of social services and sanitation services; voucher programs for proper disposal of RV sanitary sewage; establishment of designated RV "safe parking" areas or formalized encampments with appropriate services; provision of mobile pump-out services; establishing and updating sidewalk/street/plaza cleaning standards for the cleanup and appropriate disposal of human waste; and establishing trash and waste cleanup or pickup programs within the Permittee's jurisdiction, or at the countywide or regional level.

se the information generated through the biennial point-counts and related information, and the regional (as described above) to review and update their actions.

ual Report, Permittees shall collectively submit, to the Regional Executive Officer, a best management practice report as required in Provision C.17.a.i.(2).

2025 Annual Reports, Permittees shall submit a map of the jurisdiction as required in Provision C.17.a.i.(1).

2025 Annual Reports, each Permittee shall report on the current best management practices being implemented and include the jurisdiction reporting required in Provision C.17.a.i.(3) and any changes to existing actions that the Permittee will implement over existing practices.

Municipal Regional Stormwater Permit
Permit No. R2-2022-0018

NPDES Permit No. CAS612008
Provision C.17.

may be implemented include, but are not limited to, access to emergency shelters; the provision of social services and sanitation services; voucher programs for proper disposal of RV sanitary sewage; establishment of designated RV "safe parking" areas or formalized encampments with appropriate services; provision of mobile pump-out services; establishing and updating sidewalk/street/plaza cleaning standards for the cleanup and appropriate disposal of human waste; and establishing trash and waste cleanup or pickup programs within the Permittee's jurisdiction, or at the countywide or regional level.

C.17 - 3

San Jose's Claim does not Duplicate Union City's

- Union City “will incur” costs for implementing best management practices
- San Jose already implemented these practices

Provision C.17 affects San José differently than Union City

- Unsheltered Population
 - Union City
 - 489
 - San José
 - 6,200
 - 70% unsheltered
- San José's implementation costs
 - \$19,022,757 for Fiscal Year 2022-2023

Conclusion

San José respectfully requests this Commission:

- Consider its test claim; and
- Consolidate it with Union City's for efficiency.

DECLARATION OF SERVICE BY EMAIL

I, the undersigned, declare as follows:

I am a resident of the County of Sacramento and I am over the age of 18 years, and not a party to the within action. My place of employment is 980 Ninth Street, Suite 300, Sacramento, California 95814.


On September 20, 2024, I served the:

- **Current Mailing List dated September 19, 2024**
- **Appellant's Presentation for the Commission's September 27, 2024 Hearing filed September 19, 2024**

Rejection of Duplicate Test Claim Filing, 23-AEDD-01
City of San Jose, Appellant

by making it available on the Commission's website and providing notice of how to locate it to the email addresses provided on the attached mailing list.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct, and that this declaration was executed on September 20, 2024 at Sacramento, California.



Jill Magee
Commission on State Mandates
980 Ninth Street, Suite 300
Sacramento, CA 95814
(916) 323-3562

COMMISSION ON STATE MANDATES

Mailing List

Last Updated: 9/19/24

Claim Number: 23-AEDD-01

Matter: Appeal of Executive Director Decision

Claimant: City of San Jose

TO ALL PARTIES, INTERESTED PARTIES, AND INTERESTED PERSONS:

Each commission mailing list is continuously updated as requests are received to include or remove any party or person on the mailing list. A current mailing list is provided with commission correspondence, and a copy of the current mailing list is available upon request at any time. Except as provided otherwise by commission rule, when a party or interested party files any written material with the commission concerning a claim, it shall simultaneously serve a copy of the written material on the parties and interested parties to the claim identified on the mailing list provided by the commission. (Cal. Code Regs., tit. 2, § 1181.3.)

Rachelle Anema, Division Chief, *County of Los Angeles*

Accounting Division, 500 W. Temple Street, Los Angeles, CA 90012

Phone: (213) 974-8321

RANEMA@auditor.lacounty.gov

Lili Apgar, Specialist, *State Controller's Office*

Local Reimbursements Section, 3301 C Street, Suite 740, Sacramento, CA 95816

Phone: (916) 324-0254

lapgar@sco.ca.gov

Socorro Aquino, *State Controller's Office*

Division of Audits, 3301 C Street, Suite 700, Sacramento, CA 95816

Phone: (916) 322-7522

SAquino@sco.ca.gov

Aaron Avery, Legislative Representative, *California Special Districts Association*

1112 I Street Bridge, Suite 200, Sacramento, CA 95814

Phone: (916) 442-7887

Aarona@csda.net

Ginni Bella Navarre, Deputy Legislative Analyst, *Legislative Analyst's Office*

925 L Street, Suite 1000, Sacramento, CA 95814

Phone: (916) 319-8342

Ginni.Bella@lao.ca.gov

Cindy Black, City Clerk, *City of St. Helena*

1480 Main Street, St. Helena, CA 94574

Phone: (707) 968-2742

ctzafoopoulos@cityofsthehena.org

Jonathan Borrego, City Manager, *City of Oceanside*
300 North Coast Highway, Oceanside, CA 92054
Phone: (760) 435-3065
citymanager@oceasideca.org

Serena Bubenheim, Assistant Chief Financial Officer, *City of Huntington Beach*
2000 Main Street, Huntington Beach, CA 92648
Phone: (714) 536-5630
serena.bubenheim@surfcity-hb.org

Guy Burdick, Consultant, *MGT Consulting*
2251 Harvard Street, Suite 134, Sacramento, CA 95815
Phone: (916) 833-7775
gburdick@mgtconsulting.com

Allan Burdick,
7525 Myrtle Vista Avenue, Sacramento, CA 95831
Phone: (916) 203-3608
allanburdick@gmail.com

Shelby Burguan, Budget Manager, *City of Newport Beach*
100 Civic Center Drive, Newport Beach, CA 92660
Phone: (949) 644-3085
sburguan@newportbeachca.gov

Rica Mae Cabigas, Chief Accountant, *Auditor-Controller*
Accounting Division, 500 West Temple Street, Los Angeles, CA 90012
Phone: (213) 974-8309
rcabigas@auditor.lacounty.gov

Evelyn Calderon-Yee, Bureau Chief, *State Controller's Office*
Local Government Programs and Services Division, Bureau of Payments, 3301 C Street, Suite 740,
Sacramento, CA 95816
Phone: (916) 324-5919
ECalderonYee@sco.ca.gov

Sheri Chapman, General Counsel, *League of California Cities*
1400 K Street, Suite 400, Sacramento, CA 95814
Phone: (916) 658-8267
schapman@calcities.org

Annette Chinn, *Cost Recovery Systems, Inc.*
705-2 East Bidwell Street, #294, Folsom, CA 95630
Phone: (916) 939-7901
achinnrcs@aol.com

Carolyn Chu, Senior Fiscal and Policy Analyst, *Legislative Analyst's Office*
925 L Street, Suite 1000, Sacramento, CA 95814
Phone: (916) 319-8326
Carolyn.Chu@lao.ca.gov

Michael Coleman, *Coleman Advisory Services*
2217 Isle Royale Lane, Davis, CA 95616
Phone: (530) 758-3952
coleman@muni1.com

Margaret Demauro, Finance Director, *Town of Apple Valley*
14955 Dale Evans Parkway, Apple Valley, CA 92307

Phone: (760) 240-7000
mdemauro@applevalley.org

Donna Ferebee, *Department of Finance*
915 L Street, Suite 1280, Sacramento, CA 95814
Phone: (916) 445-8918
donna.ferebee@dof.ca.gov

Nora Frimann, *City Attorney, City of San Jose*
Claimant Representative
200 East Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor, San Jose, CA 95113
Phone: (408) 535-1900
nora.frimann@sanjoseca.gov

Juliana Gmur, *Commission on State Mandates*
980 9th Street, Suite 300, Sacramento, CA 95814
Phone: (916) 323-3562
juliana.gmur@csn.ca.gov

Heather Halsey, *Executive Director, Commission on State Mandates*
980 9th Street, Suite 300, Sacramento, CA 95814
Phone: (916) 323-3562
heather.halsey@csn.ca.gov

Chris Hill, *Principal Program Budget Analyst, Department of Finance*
Local Government Unit, 915 L Street, 8th Floor, Sacramento, CA 95814
Phone: (916) 445-3274
Chris.Hill@dof.ca.gov

Tiffany Hoang, *Associate Accounting Analyst, State Controller's Office*
Local Government Programs and Services Division, Bureau of Payments, 3301 C Street, Suite 740,
Sacramento, CA 95816
Phone: (916) 323-1127
THoang@sco.ca.gov

Jason Jennings, *Director, Maximus Consulting*
Financial Services, 808 Moorefield Park Drive, Suite 205, Richmond, VA 23236
Phone: (804) 323-3535
SB90@maximus.com

Angelo Joseph, *Supervisor, State Controller's Office*
Local Government Programs and Services Division, Bureau of Payments, 3301 C Street, Suite 740,
Sacramento, CA 95816
Phone: (916) 323-0706
AJoseph@sco.ca.gov

Anita Kerezsi, *AK & Company*
2425 Golden Hill Road, Suite 106, Paso Robles, CA 93446
Phone: (805) 239-7994
akcompanysb90@gmail.com

Joanne Kessler, *Fiscal Specialist, City of Newport Beach*
Revenue Division, 100 Civic Center Drive, Newport Beach, CA 90266
Phone: (949) 644-3199
jkessler@newportbeachca.gov

Lisa Kurokawa, *Bureau Chief for Audits, State Controller's Office*
Compliance Audits Bureau, 3301 C Street, Suite 700, Sacramento, CA 95816

Phone: (916) 327-3138
lkurokawa@sco.ca.gov

Fernando Lemus, Principal Accountant - Auditor, *County of Los Angeles*
Auditor-Controller's Office, 500 West Temple Street, Room 603, Los Angeles, CA 90012
Phone: (213) 974-0324
flemus@auditor.lacounty.gov

Erika Li, Chief Deputy Director, *Department of Finance*
915 L Street, 10th Floor, Sacramento, CA 95814
Phone: (916) 445-3274
erika.li@dof.ca.gov

Diego Lopez, Consultant, *Senate Budget and Fiscal Review Committee*
1020 N Street, Room 502, Sacramento, CA 95814
Phone: (916) 651-4103
Diego.Lopez@sen.ca.gov

Everett Luc, Accounting Administrator I, Specialist, *State Controller's Office*
3301 C Street, Suite 740, Sacramento, CA 95816
Phone: (916) 323-0766
ELuc@sco.ca.gov

Jill Magee, Program Analyst, *Commission on State Mandates*
980 9th Street, Suite 300, Sacramento, CA 95814
Phone: (916) 323-3562
Jill.Magee@csm.ca.gov

Darryl Mar, Manager, *State Controller's Office*
3301 C Street, Suite 740, Sacramento, CA 95816
Phone: (916) 323-0706
DMar@sco.ca.gov

Tina McKendell, *County of Los Angeles*
Auditor-Controller's Office, 500 West Temple Street, Room 603, Los Angeles, CA 90012
Phone: (213) 974-0324
tmckendell@auditor.lacounty.gov

Michelle Mendoza, *MAXIMUS*
17310 Red Hill Avenue, Suite 340, Irvine, CA 95403
Phone: (949) 440-0845
michellemendoza@maximus.com

Jill Moya, Financial Services Director, *City of Oceanside*
300 North Coast Highway, Oceanside, CA 92054
Phone: (760) 435-3887
jmoya@oceansideca.org

Marilyn Munoz, Senior Staff Counsel, *Department of Finance*
915 L Street, Sacramento, CA 95814
Phone: (916) 445-8918
Marilyn.Munoz@dof.ca.gov

Kaleb Neufeld, Assistant Controller, *City of Fresno*
2600 Fresno Street, Fresno, CA 93721
Phone: (559) 621-2489
Kaleb.Neufeld@fresno.gov

Andy Nichols, Nichols Consulting

1857 44th Street, Sacramento, CA 95819

Phone: (916) 455-3939

andy@nichols-consulting.com

Arthur Palkowitz, Law Offices of Arthur M. Palkowitz

12807 Calle de la Siena, San Diego, CA 92130

Phone: (858) 259-1055

law@artpalk.onmicrosoft.com

Kirsten Pangilinan, Specialist, State Controller's Office

Local Reimbursements Section, 3301 C Street, Suite 740, Sacramento, CA 95816

Phone: (916) 322-2446

KPangilinan@sco.ca.gov

Johnnie Pina, Legislative Policy Analyst, League of Cities

1400 K Street, Suite 400, Sacramento, CA 95814

Phone: (916) 658-8214

jpina@cacities.org

Jai Prasad, County of San Bernardino

Office of Auditor-Controller, 222 West Hospitality Lane, 4th Floor, San Bernardino, CA 92415-0018

Phone: (909) 386-8854

jai.prasad@sbcountyatc.gov

Roberta Raper, Director of Finance, City of West Sacramento

1110 West Capitol Ave, West Sacramento, CA 95691

Phone: (916) 617-4509

robertar@cityofwestsacramento.org

Cindy Sconce, Director, Government Consulting Partners

5016 Brower Court, Granite Bay, CA 95746

Phone: (916) 276-8807

cindysconcecp@gmail.com

Camille Shelton, Chief Legal Counsel, Commission on State Mandates

980 9th Street, Suite 300, Sacramento, CA 95814

Phone: (916) 323-3562

camille.shelton@csm.ca.gov

Carla Shelton, Senior Legal Analyst, Commission on State Mandates

980 9th Street, Suite 300, Sacramento, CA 95814

Phone: (916) 323-3562

carla.shelton@csm.ca.gov

Natalie Sidarous, Chief, State Controller's Office

Local Government Programs and Services Division, 3301 C Street, Suite 740, Sacramento, CA

95816

Phone: 916-445-8717

NSidarous@sco.ca.gov

Julie Testa, Vice Mayor, City of Pleasanton

123 Main Street PO Box 520, Pleasanton, CA 94566

Phone: (925) 872-6517

Jtesta@cityofpleasantonca.gov

Jolene Tollenaar, MGT Consulting Group

2251 Harvard Street, Suite 134, Sacramento, CA 95815

Phone: (916) 243-8913
jolenetollenaar@gmail.com

Brian Uhler, Principal Fiscal & Policy Analyst, *Legislative Analyst's Office*
925 L Street, Suite 1000, Sacramento, CA 95814
Phone: (916) 319-8328
Brian.Uhler@LAO.CA.GOV

Renee Wellhouse, *David Wellhouse & Associates, Inc.*
3609 Bradshaw Road, H-382, Sacramento, CA 95927
Phone: (916) 797-4883
dwa-renee@surewest.net

Adam Whelen, Director of Public Works, *City of Anderson*
1887 Howard St., Anderson, CA 96007
Phone: (530) 378-6640
awhelen@ci.anderson.ca.us

Colleen Winchester, Senior Deputy City Attorney, *City of San Jose*
Claimant Representative
200 East Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor, San Jose, CA 95113
Phone: (408) 535-1987
Colleen.Winchester@sanjoseca.gov

Jacqueline Wong-Hernandez, Deputy Executive Director for Legislative Affairs, *California State Association of Counties (CSAC)*
1100 K Street, Sacramento, CA 95814
Phone: (916) 650-8104
jwong-hernandez@counties.org

Elisa Wynne, Staff Director, *Senate Budget & Fiscal Review Committee*
California State Senate, State Capitol Room 5019, Sacramento, CA 95814
Phone: (916) 651-4103
elisa.wynne@sen.ca.gov

Kaily Yap, Budget Analyst, *Department of Finance*
Local Government Unit, 915 L Street, Sacramento, CA 95814
Phone: (916) 445-3274
Kaily.Yap@dof.ca.gov

Helmholt Zinser-Watkins, Associate Governmental Program Analyst, *State Controller's Office*
Local Government Programs and Services Division, Bureau of Payments, 3301 C Street, Suite 700,
Sacramento, CA 95816
Phone: (916) 324-7876
HZinser-watkins@sco.ca.gov